



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

Published on 21 September 2026

FOURTH SECTION

Application no. 25564/24
Pavlo Ivanovych MAKHSMA against Russia
and 7 other applications
(see table appended)

PROCEDURAL INFORMATION

Following a preliminary examination of the admissibility of the applications on 3 September 2026, the Court decided, under Rule 54 § 2 (b) of the Rules of Court, that notice of the applications should be given to the Government of Russia. It is to be noted that the issue of jurisdiction over the area where the incidents giving rise to the complaints allegedly took place has been examined and decided by the Grand Chamber of the Court in the case of *Ukraine and the Netherlands v. Russia* ([GC], nos. 8019/16 and 3 others, §§ 327-66, 9 July 2025). The Grand Chamber's finding will then be applied in these individual cases.

In some applications marked with an asterisk in the appended table, other complaints were raised. Their examination has been adjourned, or they have been struck out of the Court's list of cases or declared inadmissible by the Court, sitting in a single-judge formation, assisted by a rapporteur as provided for in Article 24 § 2 of the Convention.

In the enclosed table, whenever an applicant is referred to using initials, this indicates that the Court has authorised anonymity for that person, whose identity will not be disclosed to the public (Rule 47 § 4).

For further information on the procedure following communication of an application brought against Russia, subject of well-established case law of the Court, please refer to the Court's [Internet Site](#).

SUBJECT MATTER

The applications concern complaints raised under Article 2 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention relating to unlawful killings or infliction of life-threatening injuries sustained as a result of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine, and the lack of any effective remedy in domestic law, which are the subject of well-established case law of the Court (see *Ukraine and the Netherlands v. Russia* [GC], nos. 8019/16 and 3 others, §§ 452-66, 747-72, 1034-45 and 1619-21, 9 July 2025).

APPENDIX – STATEMENT OF FACTS

List of applications raising complaints under Article 2 § 1 and Article 13 of the Convention
(unlawful killings or life-threatening injuries sustained as a result of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine and the lack of
any effective remedy in domestic law)

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Name of direct victim Year of birth Relationship to the applicant	Location of death, disappearance or attack	Date of death, disappearance or attack	Summary of facts	Other complaints under well-established case-law
1.	25564/24 28/06/2022	Pavlo Ivanovych MAKHSMA 1958	Pavlo Ivanovych Makhsma, 1958, the applicant	17A/13 Yanvaskyy Ln., Mariupol, Donetsk region	06/03/2022	According to the applicant, on 06/03/2022, during the intense artillery shelling of Mariupol he sustained shrapnel wounds to his arms and legs, as well as numerous bruises caused by bricks propelled by the explosion. According to the medical report dated 26/05/2022, the applicant sustained an injury to his right eye, including signs of a foreign body, as well as injuries to the eardrums and a contusion. The applicant further asserted that, following the injury, he was unable to have access to adequate medical care due to the occupation of Mariupol. Although he was provided with first aid in a local hospital, the lack of medical supplies prevented the removal of the shrapnel from his eye. On 10/03/2022, the hospital where the applicant was receiving treatment was shelled, forcing him to seek refuge in the basement of a school. Due to the worsening of his health condition, the applicant was forced to leave the city on 17/03/2022. The applicant provided the following evidence: police report dated 17/05/2022; photos of a damaged apartment building; an ophthalmologist's consultation report dated 11/04/2022; medical report dated 26/05/2022.	Prot. 1 Art. 1 - damage, destruction and/or continuous lack of access to property arising from the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicant complained that his apartment no. 29 at 17 Baltiyska St, Mariupol, Donetsk region, was damaged as a result of artillery shelling on 06/03/2022, and relied on the following evidence: his passport; title documents (extract from the state register of ownership dated 21/06/2011, purchase agreement dated 17/06/2011, extract from the real estate register dated 17/06/2011); photos of the apartment (destroyed wall, destroyed roof); police report dated 17/05/2022; screenshot of the online application to the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation dated 22/06/2022; Art. 8 (1) - flight from one's home as a result of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicant complained that he was forced to flee his home in Mariupol on 17/03/2022 and relocate to Odesa, Odesa region (passport with the residence stamp for the apartment no. 29 at 17 Baltiyska St, Mariupol, Donetsk region; medical certificate from the Mechnykova hospital in Dnipro city dated 26/05/2022; and envelope with the address in Odesa, Odesa region).
2.	27695/24 23/06/2022	Maryna Petrivna CHYKOVA 1962	Maryna Petrivna Chykova, 1962, the applicant	Service cooperative OK- 'Tavriya-ST' at 152 Lisova St, Semenivka, Zaporizhzhia region	28/02/2022	According to the applicant, between 8 and 8.30 a.m. on 28/02/2022 her garden house was damaged by artillery shelling. As a result of that shelling, the applicant sustained multiple injuries. According to the medical certificate dated 04/03/2022, the applicant received a mine explosive injury, a shrapnel injury to the right thigh with extensive damage to muscle tissues and rupture of a femoral vein and artery, and a lung contusion. As a result of these injuries, the applicant underwent surgery and was officially recognised as a person with a disability (medical and social expert commission examination report dated 31/05/2022).	Prot. 1 Art. 1 - damage, destruction and/or continuous lack of access to property arising from the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicant complained that her garden house and vehicle were damaged as a result of the artillery shelling on 28/02/2022, and relied on the following evidence: title documents (extract from the real estate register dated 08/02/2018 concerning the garden house; extract from the real estate register for the land plot dated 08/02/2018; vehicle registration certificate dated 03/08/2011); photos of the damaged house (damaged ceiling, broken doors, damaged roof, broken windows, shrapnel damage to the walls and doors); photos of the damaged vehicle (broken windshield, shrapnel damage to the car); and inspection report dated 04/03/2022;

MAKHSMA v. RUSSIA AND OTHER APPLICATIONS – SUBJECT MATTER AND STATEMENT OF FACTS

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Name of direct victim Year of birth Relationship to the applicant	Location of death, disappearance or attack	Date of death, disappearance or attack	Summary of facts	Other complaints under well-established case-law
							Art. 8 (1) - flight from one's home as a result of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicant also complained that she had been forced to flee her home in Melitopol, Zaporizhzhia region, and relocate to the Khmelnytskyi region (passport registration stamp and an envelope with an address in Dunayivtsi, Khmelnytskyi region).
3.	28821/24 12/09/2022	Alina Olegivna SALIKOVA 1991 Vasyl SALIKOV 1995 Svitlana Mykolayivna SALIKOVA 1969	Olena Mykolayivna Myslyvtseva, 1974, aunt of Alina Olegivna Salikova	105 Polyetayeva Ln., Mariupol, Donetsk region	22/03/2022	On 22/03/2022, the apartment of the first applicant's aunt in Mariupol was allegedly shelled by Russian artillery. A projectile destroyed the apartment's wall, killing the first applicant's aunt. On 25/08/2022 the Vinnytsia City Court of Ukraine established the fact of the death of her aunt in Mariupol. The first applicant provided the following evidence: birth certificates and marriage certificates, photographs of the destroyed building, the judgment of the Vinnytsia City Court dated 25/08/2022 and photos of the aunt's burial place in Mariupol.	Prot. 1 Art. 1 - damage, destruction and/or continuous lack of access to property arising from the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicants complained that their properties, namely apartment no. 42 (62.4 sq. m) at 66 Budivelnkyiv Ave. (owned by the first and the third applicants); apartment no. 13 (45.4 sq. m) at 86 Budivelnkyiv Ave. (owned by the first and second applicants); apartment no. 27 (34.3 sq. m) at 97 Metalurhiv Ave. (owned by the first and the second applicants); and a private house at 105 Polyetayeva Ln. (owned by the third applicant) in Mariupol, Donetsk region, were damaged and/or destroyed by shelling in March and April 2022, and relied on the following evidence: title documents (the first apartment: purchase agreement dated 14/06/2003; extract from the real estate register dated 25/06/2003; deed of gift of 1/3 share in the apartment dated 13/12/2017; the second apartment: purchase agreement and extract from the real estate register, both dated 17/02/2020; the third apartment: purchase agreement and extract from the real estate register dated 06/05/2021; the private house: registration certificate dated 16/08/1973 and extract from the inheritance register dated 16/10/2022); marriage certificate issued in respect of the first and second applicants on 28/07/2017; screenshots of the online applications about destruction of property submitted via the DIIA website on 19/04/2022 and 26/05/2022; copies of the complaints lodged with the Ukrainian police on 05/07/2022; photos of damaged and destroyed buildings; screenshots of the applications to the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation; Art. 8 (1) - flight from one's home as a result of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicants complained that they had been forced to flee their home in Mariupol, Donetsk region, and relocate to Vinnytsia (residence registration stamps concerning the first and the third applicants; residence registration certificate issued to the second applicant by the Mariupol city council on 17/02/2021, and an envelope with an address in Vinnytsia, Vinnytsia region).

MAKHSMA v. RUSSIA AND OTHER APPLICATIONS – SUBJECT MATTER AND STATEMENT OF FACTS

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Name of direct victim Year of birth Relationship to the applicant	Location of death, disappearance or attack	Date of death, disappearance or attack	Summary of facts	Other complaints under well-established case-law
4.	31328/24 06/09/2022	Tetyana Petrivna BOBROVA 1967	Galyna Oleksiyivna Bobrova, 1937, the applicant's mother; Oleksiy Fedorovych Miski, 1946, the applicant's husband.	The applicant's mother died at her home at 204 Kotovskoho St, Mariupol, Donetsk region. The applicant's husband died on a street in the Prymorskyi district in Mariupol, Donetsk region.	02/04/2022 - death of the applicant's mother. 15/04/2022 - death of the applicant's husband.	On 19/07/2022 the applicant returned to Mariupol to search for her missing mother and husband, with whom she had lost contact on 24/03/2022. She discovered that her mother had died at home on 02/04/2022 due to a lack of medical assistance and had been buried in the garden of her house. On 29/07/2022 her mother was reburied in a cemetery. She also learned that her husband had been killed on 15/04/2022 by a fragment from combat in a street in the Prymorskyi district of Mariupol and was buried in a cemetery. The deaths of both relatives were officially confirmed by the judgments of the Khmelnytskyi City Court dated 30/08/2022. The applicant provided the following evidence: her passport and birth certificate; her husband's passport; their marriage certificate; medical certificate of her mother's cause of death issued on 29/07/2022; judgment of the Khmelnytskyi City Court dated 30/08/2022 establishing the fact of her mother's death; her mother's death certificate dated 31/08/2022; judgment of Khmelnytskyi City Court dated 30/08/2022 establishing the fact of her husband's death; and her husband's death certificate dated 31/08/2022.	Prot. 1 Art. 1 - damage, destruction and/or continuous lack of access to property arising from the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicant complained that her apartment no. 7 at 3 Bohdana Khmelnytskoho Blvd. and her house at 204 Persha Slobodka St in Mariupol, Donetsk region, were allegedly damaged between 23/03/2022 and 16/04/2022, and relied on the following evidence: her passport; title documents (purchase agreement dated 21/11/1998 concerning the apartment; inheritance certificate and extract from the real estate register dated 20/04/2018 concerning the house); extract from the Ukrainian register of criminal investigations dated 31/08/2022; and a screenshot of the applicant's submission to the Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation (according to the applicant, she became aware of the damage in July 2022 when she returned to Mariupol to search for her missing mother and husband); Art. 8 (1) - flight from one's home as a result of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicant complained that she had been forced to flee her home in Mariupol, Donetsk region, and to relocate to Khmelnytskyi, Khmelnytskyi region (IDP certificate dated 01/04/2022).
5.	33340/24 24/08/2022	Oleksandr Sergiyovych MALKIN 1987 Olena Anatoliyivna MALKINA 1959	Anatoliy Panfilovych Malkin, 1935, father of Olena Anatoliyivna Malkina and grandfather of Oleksandr Sergiyovych Malkin	Apartment no. 3 at 52 Pashkovskoho St, Mariupol, Donetsk region	24/03/2022	The applicants stated that their father/grandfather was killed as a result of artillery shelling targeting their apartment in Mariupol, Donetsk region. The applicants relied on the following evidence: their father/grandfather's passport with a residence stamp indicating the address of the aforementioned apartment; death certificate dated 15/06/2022, indicating the date of death as 24/03/2022; witness statements dated 24/03/2022; and decision of the Ivano-Frankivsk District Court dated 10/06/2022, confirming the date and circumstances of the death of the direct victim.	Prot. 1 Art. 1 - damage, destruction and/or continuous lack of access to property arising from the conflict between Russia and Ukraine – the applicants complained that their apartment no. 3 (73.9 sq. m) at 52 Pashkovskoho St, Mariupol, Donetsk region, was destroyed by fire as a result of the artillery shelling on 24/03/2022, and relied on the following evidence: the applicants' passports; title documents (purchase agreement and an extract from the real estate register dated 06/04/2013, indicating that each applicant owns ½ share in the apartment); photos of the destroyed property (showing a residential building reduced to rubble; explosion holes in the walls; few walls left; no windows left; debris in the yard; traces of burning and soot on the facade); Mr Malkin's victim's memo issued by the Ukrainian police on 20/05/2022; witness statements dated 24/03/2022; Art. 8 (1) - flight from one's home as a result of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicants complained that they had been forced to flee their home in Mariupol, Donetsk region, in March 2022, and to relocate to Ivano-Frankivsk (the applicants' passports

MAKHSMA v. RUSSIA AND OTHER APPLICATIONS – SUBJECT MATTER AND STATEMENT OF FACTS

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Name of direct victim Year of birth Relationship to the applicant	Location of death, disappearance or attack	Date of death, disappearance or attack	Summary of facts	Other complaints under well-established case-law
							with the residence stamps for the apartment in Mariupol; rental agreement for the apartment in Ivano-Frankivsk dated 01/03/2022).
6.	35005/24 04/08/2022	Mykola Fedorovych BOCHAROV 1955	Tetiana Mykolayivna Bocharova, 1951, the applicant's wife	Apartment no. 1 at 71 Pashkovskoho St, Mariupol, Donetsk region	05/04/2022	The applicant and his wife lived in apartment no. 5 at 92 Kyivska St, Mariupol, Donetsk region. On 28/02/2022, they fled their place of residence and moved to apartment no. 1 at 71 Pashkovskoho St, Mariupol, Donetsk region, which belongs to the applicant's son. On 10/03/2022, the apartment of the applicant's son was severely damaged as a result of shelling (windows were broken, and the front door was damaged). The applicant and his spouse remained in the apartment in extremely harsh conditions, without access to food, water, or heating. The mental and physical health of the applicant's wife deteriorated; she experienced severe distress due to the ongoing shelling of the city. The couple was unable to obtain medical treatment, as all medical facilities had been destroyed. On 05/04/2022, the applicant's spouse lost her life due to the lack of medical care, exposure to cold, starvation, and stress. The applicant buried his wife in the courtyard of the building where his son's apartment was located. The applicant provided the following evidence: his and his wife's passports with marriage registration stamps and residence registration stamps for apartment no. 5 at 92 Kyivska St, Mariupol, Donetsk region; a photo of the severely damaged house in which the applicant's spouse died; death certificate dated 18/07/2022; photos of the applicant's wife's burial place; a screenshot from a chat in the Viber application containing information about the burial of the applicant's wife; photos of the destroyed property (completely destroyed building, where the applicant's apartment was located); and a written complaint to the Ukrainian prosecutor's office, bearing the prosecutor's signature acknowledging its receipt on 15/06/2022.	Prot. 1 Art. 1 - damage, destruction and/or continuous lack of access to property arising from the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicant complained that his apartment no. 5 (79.6 sq. m) at 92 Kyivska St, Mariupol, Donetsk region had been destroyed by an airstrike between 28/02/2022 and 08/04/2022, and relied on the following evidence: title documents for 1/3 share in the apartment (ownership certificate dated 09/12/1994; technical passport dated 14/08/2012; extract from the real estate register confirming 1/4 share in the apartment dated 19/10/2012; extract from the real estate register confirming 1/12 share in the apartment dated 19/10/2012); photos of the destroyed property (completely destroyed building, where the applicant's apartment was located); and a written complaint lodged with the Ukrainian prosecutor's office, bearing the prosecutor's signature acknowledging its receipt on 15/06/2022; Art. 8 (1) - flight from one's home as a result of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine - the applicant complained that he had been forced to flee his home in Mariupol, Donetsk region, and relocate to Kamianets-Podilskyi, Khmelnytskyi region (IDP certificate dated 09/05/2022).
7.	35164/24 14/09/2022	Yevgen Oleksandrovych GONCHAROV 1986	Yevgen Oleksandrovych Goncharov, 1986, the applicant	Apartment no. 22A at 19 Troitska St, Dnipro, Dnipropetrovsk region	11/09/2022	The applicant claimed that during a missile attack one of the missiles struck a courtyard approximately 50 metres from his apartment, as a result of which he sustained bodily injuries (shrapnel wounds). He submitted that he was bleeding and had to administer first aid to himself. The applicant claimed that this incident posed a serious risk to his life. The applicant provided the following evidence: his passport; photos of his injuries (shrapnel wounds and a	Prot. 1 Art. 1 - damage, destruction and/or continuous lack of access to property arising from the conflict between Russia and Ukraine – the applicant complained that his apartment no. 22A (45 sq. m) at 19 Troitska St, Dnipro, Dnipropetrovsk region, was damaged as a result of the missile attack on 11/09/2022, and relied on the following evidence: his passport; title document (extract from the real estate register dated 25/11/2021); photographs of the damaged apartment; local newspaper articles about the damage to the applicant's

MAKHSMA v. RUSSIA AND OTHER APPLICATIONS – SUBJECT MATTER AND STATEMENT OF FACTS

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Name of direct victim Year of birth Relationship to the applicant	Location of death, disappearance or attack	Date of death, disappearance or attack	Summary of facts	Other complaints under well-established case-law
						bleeding palm); written complaints to the Ukrainian police dated 11/09/2022; and the screenshot of a news article from local media reporting the applicant's story, which stated that he had nearly been killed by a Russian missile, dated 12/09/2022.	apartment caused by the shelling; complaint lodged with the Ukrainian police on 11/09/2022; Art. 8 (1) - interference with the right to home - the apartment in question was the applicant's home, as confirmed by his photos taken in the apartment, the news article, and his statements.
8.	1481/25* 06/07/2022	Olena Sergiyivna KLYMOVA 1989	Sergiy Leonidovych Stakhorsky, 1962, the applicant's father	Private house at 13 Voyenny Ln., Mykolaiv, Mykolaiv region	07/03/2022	On 07/03/2022, at approximately 1 p.m., the house where the applicant's father was residing was allegedly shelled by the Russian armed forces. As a result, the applicant's father was killed instantly. The medical death certificate confirmed that the applicant's father died as a result of shrapnel and gunshot wounds. The applicant provided the following documents: her birth certificate; her father's death certificate dated 16/04/2022; and the medical death certificate dated 10/03/2022.	Prot. 1 Art. 1 - damage, destruction and/or continuous lack of access to property arising from the conflict between Russia and Ukraine – the applicant complained that her father's private house (185 sq. m) at 13 Voyenny Ln., Mykolaiv, Mykolaiv region, was damaged by the shelling on 07/03/2022, and relied on the following evidence: her passport; her birth certificate; her marriage certificate; title documents (extract from the real estate register dated 06/02/2017; extract from the land estate register dated 19/12/2018; technical passport dated 30/11/2016; extract from the inheritance register dated 26/05/2022); photos of the damaged house (damaged roof and ceiling, destroyed wall, broken windows); and a police report dated 29/04/2022; Art. 8 (1) - interference with the right to home - the apartment in question was the applicant's home as confirmed by her passport registration stamp and statements.